

## COMMITTEE REPORT

**Date:** 20 October 2011      **Ward:** Guildhall  
**Team:** Major                      and **Parish:** Guildhall Planning Panel  
                    Commercial Team

**Reference:** 11/01999/LBC  
**Application at:** Bootham School 51 Bootham York YO30 7BT  
**For:** New Music and Art building, including alteration and extension to  
                    Assembly Hall building.  
**By:** Bootham School  
**Application Type:** Listed Building Consent  
**Target Date:** 3 October 2011  
**Recommendation:** Approve

### 1.0 PROPOSAL

1.1 Listed Building Consent is sought for a new building which would be connected to the south-east side of the grade 2 listed School Assembly Hall within the Bootham School site. The School Assembly Hall was constructed in 1965/65, designed by Trevor Dannatt. The building was listed in 2007 for its pioneering aesthetic & technical qualities, and its symbolic use of space and form. As part of the application there are also proposals to clean the external concrete on the the Assembly Hall.

1.2 The new building would provide a performance room, classrooms and a café/foyer/entrance area that would connect into the Assembly Hall. The existing music building, to which the proposed building would also connect, would be converted to provide an exhibition space for art. The proposals will enable the music and art facilities at the school to be linked and the connection will provide the communal gathering space the Assembly Room presently lacks.

1.3 The building would be of comparable massing to the Assembly Hall although the sloping roof would be 1.5m higher at its highest point. The connection to the Assembly Hall would be single storey; glass fronted to form a continuation of the existing ground floor façade. The new building would step forward around 6.5m from the Assembly Hall, although the ground floor would be recessed back by around 2m. When viewed alongside the Assembly Hall the proposed building would be predominantly glazed at ground floor level, with timber cladding above and a copper eaves detail. Along the SE elevation the building would have a brick base. The roof would be part flat, in this area it would accommodate photovoltaic panels, with a sloping sedum roof behind. The roof includes four chimneys which allow natural ventilation. The existing music building would receive a single storey extension to its west side and a more recent 2-storey extension to the east elevation would be removed.

## **2.0 POLICY CONTEXT**

### **2.1 Development Plan Allocation:**

Areas of Archaeological Interest GMS Constraints: City Centre Area 0006

Conservation Area GMS Constraints: Central Historic Core CONF

Listed Buildings GMS Constraints:

Grade 2\*; 49 Bootham York YO3 7BT 0463

Grade 2 : Bootham School Assembly Hall Bootham

Grade 2\*; Bootham School, Library And Railings 51 Bootham 0462

Grade 2\*; 47 Bootham York YO3 7BT 0464

### **2.2 Policies:**

CYHE4

Listed Buildings

## **3.0 CONSULTATIONS**

### **DESIGN AND CONSERVATION**

3.1 Officers support the scheme. The proposals would have less than significant harm, caused due to the loss of the landscaped setting of the Assembly Hall. The impact is mitigated as; the proposed building has merits in its own right and in time will add to the considerable architectural legacy on site, and the scheme delivers considerable benefits through improving facilities at the Assembly Hall and at Bootham School overall.

3.2 The Assembly Hall was designed as a stand-alone building and the green landscape surroundings assist in softening the harshness of the concrete. It is fundamental that the pavilion quality of the existing building can still be appreciated. The Hall foyer has a fully glazed screen wall, whilst the wall mainly looks out to the south and west, a single panel wraps around the SE corner. This preserves the open quality of the Hall and the weightless appearance of the concrete upper tier. Unfortunately the corner would be altered to allow for the link through to the new building. In addition the external staircase which gives relief to the SE elevation of concrete would be retained though subsumed by the extension.

3.3 Harm to the fabric and character of the building caused by linking it to the new structure would be mitigated by the following:

- The new facility would link to the SE corner of the building; the setting of the main entrance facades of the Assembly Hall (NW & SW) would be unaffected. The

position for the link has been chosen to minimize harm to the structure and maximize useability of the grouped facilities. The link would be at low level and allow the two buildings to read as separate masses.

- The new foyer is glazed and has been set back from the upper floor so that views across the site (toward the Assembly Hall) are revealed at an earlier stage when entering via the pedestrian entrance from Bootham along Photographic Lane.

- The west facade of the new building has been designed to emphasize the building's independence and its extruded form. In important views from the main school reception, within the site to west, the materials palette would compliment the existing building; copper, glass, and the cedar board cladding to the main spaces, which will echo the texture of the concrete on the Assembly Hall, eventually go silvery grey and tone in with the adjacent building. The bricks chosen for the ground floor and separating stair towers would not be seen externally close to the existing building.

3.4 Officers support the proposed method for cleaning the building. It is the intention to remove organic matter to prevent further absorption of water on the face of the structure. It is not intended to present the building as new, though heavily soiled patches might be improved. Proposals would be benign if carried out when there is no danger of frost.

## ENGLISH HERITAGE

3.5 No objection to the development in principle. The key issues EH draw attention to are the junction between the existing and proposed building, and proposals to clean the Assembly Hall building.

3.6 The Assembly Hall is a building which has a very sculptural presence and was designed to be seen 'in the round'. The south-east side (where the new building is proposed) comprises an uncompromising sheer wall of board-marked reinforced concrete, with a reinforced concrete staircase leading down from first floor level. The new building will abut this escape stair and the south-east wall will be partly covered and partly enclosed within a new courtyard (from which part of the wall of the Assembly Hall would still be visible).

3.7 Detailing of the addition to the Assembly Hall foyer will be important in the protection of the architectural quality and hence the significance of the Assembly Hall. EH have discussed the matter with the school and recommended an approach which would allow the glazing column at the south-east corner to remain fully expressed and turn the corner. The new roof should be attached to the Assembly Hall beneath the chamfered concrete overhang and beneath the top of the existing concrete staircase.

3.8 Cleaning: EH question the wisdom of cleaning the concrete in this instance as there are some old concrete repairs that would become more visible than they are now. Also, EH would not wish any cleaning to cause the concrete to become any more vulnerable to corrosion. The issue of applying a protective coating to the external concrete of the Assembly Hall has also been raised by the School. EH suggest that any such coating, along with any proposed cleaning method, be trialled on a small, discreet area to assess its appearance before any wider application is allowed.

## GUILDHALL PLANNING PANEL

3.9 No objection.

## PUBLICITY

3.10 No objections have been made to the LBC application.

## **4.0 APPRAISAL**

### KEY ISSUES

4.1 In considering whether to grant Listed Building Consent, according to the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, the LPA is required to have special regard to the desirability of preserving a listed building, its setting and any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. This is re-iterated in Local Plan policy HE4.

### POLICIES

4.2 National policy PPS5 relates to listed buildings. PPS5 advises that a building's contribution to its setting can be sustained or enhanced if new buildings are carefully designed to respect their setting by virtue of their scale, proportion, height, massing, alignment and use of materials. The PPS recognizes that in some cases change to listed buildings may be necessary over time. Where development would have a harmful impact LPA's are required to weigh the harm against any heritage benefits. The English Heritage companion note to the PPS lists heritage benefits as where a scheme:

- Sustains or enhances the significance of a heritage asset and the contribution of its setting.
- Reduces or removes risks to a heritage asset.
- Secures the optimum viable use of a heritage asset in support of its long term conservation.
- Makes a positive contribution to economic vitality and sustainable communities.

- Is an appropriate design for its context and makes a positive contribution to the appearance, character, quality and local distinctiveness of the historic environment.

## ASSESSMENT

4.3 The school has a 6 year masterplan which includes improvement of the music and arts facilities which are presently cramped and unsuitable for some of the students. It has been identified that the Assembly Hall lacks a communal focal point where users of the building can gather between performances. The scheme will address these issues, providing a linked area for music, art and performance space, and a meeting/social space which would also serve the Assembly Hall.

4.4 The Assembly Hall building was originally conceived as a stand alone building within an open setting. The main elevations are the NW and SW; those which are predominantly glazed at ground floor level. The landscaping around the building draws people in via the SW corner, aligned with the school's reception entrance. The SE elevation is not one of the primary elevations and thus there is scope to add a building to this side. The proposed connection point at the south corner is most appropriate as it would minimise intervention to the Assembly Hall, and allow combined use of the facilities within the proposed building.

4.5 To address English Heritage comments regarding the design of the connection point a large scale detail has been provided which demonstrates how the link would connect with the existing glazed panels and the concrete above. The connection would sit back slightly from the glass facade to retain the completeness of the existing frontage as recommended by EH. The roof would be glazed with a slight pitch and would abut the concrete above the chamfered base. The connection uses a silicone fixing which avoids using flashings and cutting the existing concrete; the fixing would though require small screw holes to be drilled into the concrete at 400mm intervals.

4.6 The single storey glazed link will allow the two buildings to read as being separate. The new addition would be sympathetic in terms of its massing, materials, proportions and horizontal emphasis. The proposed building would not be over dominant as the amount the ground floor is recessed means views of the Assembly Hall from the Photographic Lane entrance to the school site are preserved and from the west the building would appear to harmoniously sit behind the Assembly Hall.

4.7 Discussions are ongoing with officers with regards the detailing to the landscaping around the Assembly Hall. It is sought to retain the character of the space outside the Hall, which is contemporary with the building and the final choice of surface materials throughout the site are to be agreed. These issues can be covered through a condition in the companion planning permission.

4.8 The method statement for cleaning the building has been assessed and provided the cleaning is undertaken at an appropriate time, this will maintain the appearance of the listed building.

4.9 Overall whilst there would be some harm by adding a building to the side of the Assembly Hall in place of a landscaped area, and by connecting to the building, which was designed to 'stand alone', the works are justified and in the interest of keeping the Assembly Hall in optimum viable use. In addition the scheme is considered in its approach. The development achieves the required change whilst minimizing the harm to the listed building. In addition the new building has its own merits and is an appropriate addition to the setting.

## 5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1 The scheme has been designed so the harm caused, by adding a building to the side of the hall, and removal of the landscaping to its side, is minimised and deemed as 'less than substantial' in PPS5 terms. The scheme would deliver heritage benefits, by enhancing the facilities within an existing listed building, in the interests of its long term preservation, and by improving the facilities at the school. In addition the proposed building is deemed to be well-considered; respectful of its setting and of merit in its own right. As such it is recommended consent be granted as the heritage benefits outweigh the harm.

## COMMITTEE TO VISIT

### 6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Approve

1 TIMEL2 Development start within 3 yrs (LBC/CAC) -

2 The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following plans:-

Squires and Brown drawings A-05  
Site Plan 101C  
Floor Plans: 104J, 105H, 106H, 107D  
Elevations: 110D, 111D, 112C

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the development is carried out only as approved by the Local Planning Authority.

3 Samples of the external materials to be used shall be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of the development. A sample panel of the brickwork to be used shall be erected on the site and shall illustrate the colour, texture and bonding of brickwork and the mortar treatment to be

used, and shall be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of building works. This panel shall be retained until a minimum of 2 square metres of wall of the approved development has been completed in accordance with the approved sample. The development shall be carried out using the approved materials.

Note: Notwithstanding the palette of materials shown in the submitted sample board the timber finish for window frames, louvers and the exposed structure shall be similar to each other and tone in with the eventual colour of the cedar cladding. To assist in achieving this, it is asked trial samples are provided on site for approval prior to any work commencing.

Reason: So as to achieve a visually cohesive appearance.

4 Large scale details (at 1:20 and 1:5) of the items listed below shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of the development and the works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

a) All new elevations and roofs, including typical intersections between elements at agreed locations. Sections through complete walls, showing the relationship between apertures, expressed structure, eaves, verge and plinth conditions; to demonstrate an elegance of detailing which is similar to the approach taken for the Assembly Hall.

b) Alterations to the Assembly Hall glazing panel and abutment conditions adjacent to the concrete walls and staircase (3D drawing(s) to be supplied also).

Making good shall be carried out to a high standard and to match existing materials, finishes and details.

Reason: To ensure the development hereby approved does not detract from the listed building and its setting.

5 Large scale details of the items listed below shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of the development and the works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

a) External doors, windows and window systems (including any solar shading devices) and roof-lights shown in context.

b) Roof detail, to include vents, solar chimneys and panels, sun-pipes, external plant and any plant housings or other externally fixed equipment.

Details to include details of the refurbished music building.

Reason: To ensure the development hereby approved does not detract from the listed building and its setting.

6 Details of making good to the newly exposed cottage wall shall be approved in writing and the development carried out accordingly. Where possible bricks shall be reclaimed from the demolished extension for reuse.

Reason: To ensure the development hereby approved does not detract from the listed building and its setting.

7 A method statement and schedule of repairs for the concrete walls of the assembly hall shall be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to such works commencing. Mortar samples shall be provided on site for agreement.

8 Trial areas of the proposed cleaning method shall be carried out in agreed locations and a method of cleaning subsequently approved by the Local Planning Authority prior to such works commencing. The cleaning shall be carried out in accordance with the agreed method thereafter.

Reason: To preserve the architectural interest of the listed building.

## **7.0 INFORMATIVES:**

### **Notes to Applicant**

#### 1. REASON FOR APPROVAL

In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the proposal, subject to the conditions listed above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to the impact on heritage assets. As such the proposal complies with Policy HE4 of the City of York Development Control Local Plan.

#### **Contact details:**

**Author:** Jonathan Kenyon Development Management Officer

**Tel No:** 01904 551323